

CITY OF SAN MARINO
CITY COUNCIL AGENDA

Steve Talt, Mayor

Steven W. Huang, DDS, Vice Mayor

Susan Jakubowski, Council Member

Gretchen Shepherd Romey, Council Member

Ken Ude, Council Member

Marcella Marlowe, Ph.D., City Manager



www.cityofsanmarino.org

(626) 300-0700 Phone

(626) 300-0709 Fax

City Hall Council Chamber

2200 Huntington Drive

San Marino, CA 91108

MONDAY, MAY 21, 2018 AT 8:00 A.M.
CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBER
2200 HUNTINGTON DRIVE, SAN MARINO, CA 91108

PUBLIC HEARING

The City of San Marino appreciates your attendance. Citizens' interest provides the Council with valuable information regarding issues of the community.

Regular Meetings are held on the 2nd Wednesday of every month at 6:00 p.m. Adjourned Regular Meetings are held on the last Friday of every month at 8:00 a.m.

In compliance with the American Disabilities Act, any person with a disability who requires a modification or accommodation in order to participate in a meeting should contact the City Clerk's Office at (626) 300-0705 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting.

CALL TO ORDER

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

ROLL CALL: Council Member Jakubowski, Council Member Shepherd Romey, Council Member Ude, Vice Mayor Huang, and Mayor Talt

PUBLIC COMMENTS

The City Council welcomes public input. Members of the public may address the City Council by completing a public comment card and giving it to the City Clerk prior to the meeting. At this time, the public may address the City Council on items that are not on the agenda. Pursuant to state law, the City Council may not discuss or take action on issues not on the meeting agenda (Government Code Section 54954.2). The Mayor reserves the right to place limits on duration of comments. Staff may be asked to follow up on such items.

PUBLIC HEARING

1. **APPEAL REGARDING DESIGN REVIEW CASE NO. DRC17-08 FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW HOUSE FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1400 CIRCLE DRIVE**

Recommendation: Staff recommends the City Council approve Design Review Case No. DRC17-08 as submitted.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

ADJOURNMENT

Dated: May 17, 2018

Posted: May 17, 2018

VERONICA RUIZ, CMC
CITY CLERK

City of San Marino
AGENDA REPORT



TO: MAYOR AND CITY COUNCIL

FROM: MARCELLA MARLOWE, PH.D., CITY MANAGER

BY: ALDO CERVANTES, DIRECTOR OF PLANNING AND BUILDING

DATE: MAY 21, 2018

SUBJECT: **APPEAL REGARDING DESIGN REVIEW CASE NO. DRC17-08 FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW HOUSE, 1400 CIRCLE DRIVE**

Steve Talt, Mayor

Steven W. Huang, DDS, Vice-Mayor

Susan Jakubowski, Council Member

Gretchen Shepherd Romey, Council Member

Ken Ude, Council Member

STRATEGIC PLAN CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS:

- Engaged and Connected Residents
- Efficient, Responsive, and Effective City Services
- Beautiful, Preserved, Single-Family Residential Neighborhoods

BACKGROUND:

Stephen Gleason, the owner of 1380 Circle Drive, filed this appeal of the Planning Commission's approval of a Design Review Case ("DRC") 17-08 concerning the development of a residential project on 1400 Circle Drive. The project would include a two-story, six-bedroom house with a basement, and an attached four-car garage. A Design Review action is required for new or replacement residential structures (SMCC 23.15.03B).

On February 28, 2018, the Planning Commission held a public hearing on the project, after which it determined that the required findings could be made and approved the project. Subsequent to this decision, the property owner at 1380 Circle Drive, filed this appeal.

At the April 11, 2018 City Council meeting, staff presented the Council with the options in handling the project on appeal. Pursuant to the Sections 23.15.10 of the Code, the City Council may do one of the following:

A. Affirm the action of the commission; or

B. Require a summary of all evidence upon which the commission made its decision; after receiving such evidence, the council shall take such action based on standards contained in section 23.15.08 of this article as, in its opinion, is indicated by such evidence alone; or

C. Refer the matter back to the commission, with or without direction; or

D. Instruct the city clerk to set the matter for hearing within forty (40) days before itself. At such hearing, it shall hear and decide the case de novo. Such hearing shall be conducted in the manner and with the notice herein prescribed for the commission.

At the conclusion of the meeting, the Council moved to approve option D, to set the appeal for public hearing within 40 days.

PROPOSAL:

The applicant requests permission to construct a two-story residence with basement containing six (6) bedrooms and an attached four (4) car garage. This requires one design review actions pursuant to City Code Section 23.15.03B.

DESIGN REVIEW NO. DRC17-08 – New Residential Structure

This project was first presented to the Planning Commission on September 27, 2017 and the project scope included a seventh bedroom in the basement and a front yard fence and gate. At that hearing, the Planning Commission denied the project due to the failure of meeting the design review conditions. The Planning Commission also discussed the significance of the original Architect, Robert Finkelhor. Subsequent to the denial, the applicant submitted a timely appeal of this decision to the City Council. At the City Council meeting held on December 13, 2017, the City Council remanded the project back to the Commission to allow for the review of the new information. The new information included a historic assessment of the property and design modifications to the proposed house.

- General Plan: Estate Residential 0-2 du/acres. The proposed project is consistent with the goals and objectives of the General Plan. The proposed project maintains the appropriate mass and scale as compared with the residential neighborhood.
- Zoning: R-1, Area District 1.
- Location: The subject property is located on the north side of Circle Drive between Rosalind Road and the Circle Drive bridge.
- Existing Use: Two-story single family home with an attached three-car garage.
- Proposed Use: A two-story house with an attached four-car garage
- Surrounding Uses: Adjacent land uses include single family homes in R-1, Area Districts 1.
- Environmental Determination: The project is categorically exempt for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Government Code Section 15303(a), New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures.

CRITERIA	CODE	PROVIDED
ZONING:	R-1, D I	
Maximum Living Area/Lot Coverage	6,600 sq. ft.	6,531 sq. ft. Livable area. 4,957 sq. ft. Lot coverage
HEIGHT:		
Maximum Allowed	35 ft.	27 ft. 7.5 in.
YARDS:		
Front	50 ft.	51 ft. - 4.5 inches
Side	20 ft.	7 feet to the north and 39 feet to the south
Rear	40 ft.	58 ft.
PARKING AND DRIVEWAYS:		
Garage Spaces	Three-car garage	Four-car garage
DISTANCE BETWEEN BLDGS.		
	n/a	n/a
IMPERVIOUS COVERAGE:		
Percentage	45%	35%
DESIGN:		
Architectural Style	Italianate	Italianate

Historic Assessment Findings:

The owner of the subject site commissioned the assistance of Tim Gregory to prepare a historic evaluation of the property and the original Architect, Robert Finkelhor. The property was evaluated using the National Register of Historic Places, California Register of Historic Resources and the City of San Marino criteria. Page 11 of the Historic Assessment finds that Robert Finkelhor is not a notable architect. According to the report, Robert Finkelhor “remains almost completely undocumented in architectural research sources and index.” “Finkelhor did not have a significant style that would make his houses easily identifiable visually, unlike those by such top-tier architects as Wallace Neff and Paul, whose works are recognizably consistent quality. In addition, “It should be mentioned that Finkelhor concentrated his work in the west side of Los Angeles Basin and had little impact on the local scene, with 1440 Circle Drive being his only design documented in San Marino thus far.”

With regards to the home, it was found that the “design features of 1400 Circle Drive do not surpass in quality, distinctiveness, or detailing those of the many other more modest Italian Period Revival of its type still extant in the City of San Marino.” It was also found that due to a significant addition to the house in 2006, the home has lost any integrity it may have once had.

Due to these findings, staff maintains that the project remains categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Government Code Section 15303(a), New Construction.



City of San Marino
 2200 Huntington Drive
 San Marino, CA 91108
 (626) 300-0711

PLANNING
 COMMISSION HEARING

Calculation of Planning and Design Review Fees

For up to three conditional use permit, variance and/or design review applications for a single project to be processed concurrently, the fee collected shall be the fee required for the single highest application. For more than three such applications, the fee collected shall be the cost as provided, plus the cost for each additional individual application.

Please complete the following:

1. Date: 5.10.17
2. The undersigned applicant(s) is (are) the owner(s) of property located at:
1400 Circle Drive
3. And legally described as follow (Lot No., Block No., Tract No.):
Lot 6, Tract No. 2949
(legal description may be attached separately if necessary)
4. State in your own words:
 - a. The use (or improvement) you intend to make to the above described property:
Construction of (ND) ~~2~~ 6,531 sq ft
2-story, single-family residence w/
basement
 - b. The provisions or restrictions of the code which prompts the need for this application:
CUP request for 7 bedrooms, exceeding
what's allowed per zoning code.
5. I (we) certify or declare under penalty of perjury, that the foregoing is true and correct.
I (we) also understand that in submitting this application that I (we) am (are) to expect City officials to conduct exterior inspections of my (our) property.

Signatures of all owners of record of the property herein described: [Signature]
1400 Circle Drive

Mailing Address: 1400 Circle Dr. San Marino, Ca 91108

Owner's Phone Number (Home): ()

Owner's Phone Number (Work): (818) 512 8486

Agent's Name and Address: Shushan Giezalyan c/o James
Cooney & Assoc. 30 N. Raymond Ave Ste 611, Pasadena

Agent's Phone Number: (626) 584 6922 Ca 91103

*The verification form being signed under penalty of perjury does not require notarization.

